720 ROGERS RD • VILLA HILLS, KY 41017 • (859) 341-1515 • FAX (859) 341-0012

Meeting #678 Minutes December 19, 2018

Mayor Irvin T. "Butch" Callery called the December 19, 2018 meeting of City of Villa Hills Council (Meeting #678) to order at 6:30 p.m. at the Dennis M. Stein Municipal Building, 719 Rogers Road, Villa Hills, Kentucky. Mr. Kilburn gave the prayer and Mayor Callery led the Pledge of Allegiance.

A roll call was taken. Those in attendance:

Mayor Callery

G. Bruns

G. Kilburn

M. Koenig

S. Ringo

J. Vaden

G. Waugaman

Mary Ann Stewart, City Attorney Craig Bohman, City Administrator/Clerk Chief Allen, Police Department Derick Yelton, Public Works Director Matt Bogen, City Engineer

A quorum was present.

The first item on the agenda was approval of the minutes of the November 28, 2018 Special Meeting, #677. Motion made by Ms. Koenig, seconded by Mr. Kilburn. A voice vote was taken, motion carried all in favor.

The next item on the agenda was a presentation by The Benedictine Sisters of St. Walburg Monastery.

• Sr. Mary Catherine Wenstrup addressed the Mayor and Council and read a letter of thanks for the council's support and encouragement. She explained the need to sell their land to fund their retirement and the requirement to rezone the land to make their land marketable. Mayor Callery thanked the Sisters for their comments. Ms. Koenig also thanked the Sisters. The Sisters responded by stating that it was a privilege to work with The Mayor and Council. Mr. Waugaman apologized to the Sisters for the way the public treated them during the debates on the zone change.

The next item on the agenda was a Presentation of Citizen of the Year award to Tom Noll.

- Mayor Callery called Tom Noll forward to receive The Citizen of the Year Award and read a Proclamation declaring Thursday December 20, 2018 as Tom Noll Day. He presented Mr. Noll with the Citizen of the Year Award.
- Mr. Noll commented that there are many people in the city more deserving of this award than him. He stated that he has served a long time and other people should have the opportunity to serve.

The next item on the agenda was a presentation to the outgoing Mayor and Council.

- Mayor Callery presented tokens of appreciation to each of the council members whose terms ended.
- Ms. Koenig presented Mayor Callery with a token of appreciation and commented that Mayor Callery moved into the city in 2011 and was recruited to run in 2014. She noted that he jumped right in took the city from one without respect to a city that is highly regarded in the wider community. Ms. Koenig thanked Mayor Callery for his service on behalf of Council, the staff and the residents and presented Mayor Callery with a gift of appreciation.

Legislation:

2nd reading of and consideration for approval of draft Ordinance 2018-J. This is an
Ordinance of the City of Villa Hills adopting the 2018 S-5 Supplement to the City of
Villa Hills Code of Ordinances, as recently prepared by the American Legal Publishing
Corporation. Mr. Kilburn made a motion to approve, seconded by Mr. Waugaman. A
roll call vote was taken as follows:

Mr. Bruns	Yes	Mr. Ringo	Yes
Mr. Kilburn	Yes	Ms. Vaden	Yes
Ms. Koenig	Yes	Mr. Waugaman	Yes

Motion carried 6-0, all in favor. This will be come Ordinance 2018-10.

2nd reading and approval of draft Ordinance 2018-K (as amended). This is an ordinance to amend section 30.37 of the City of Villa Hills Code of Ordinances revising the schedule for the council committee meetings; and establishing meeting dates for January 2019. Mr. Bohman clarified the corrections to the original draft. Mr. Waugaman made a motion to approve, seconded by Mr. Bruns. A roll call vote was taken as follows:

Mr. Bruns	Yes	Mr. Ringo	Yes
Mr. Kilburn	Yes	Ms. Vaden	Yes
Ms. Koenig	Yes	Mr. Waugaman	Yes

Motion carried 6-0, all in favor. This will become Ordinance 2018-11.

• 2nd reading and approval of draft Ordinance 2018-L. This is an ordinance of the City of Villa Hills amending the City's budget and Ordinance 2018-4 by amending Revenues, Contracted Services, Administration, Police, and the Capital Fund Budgets. This amended budget ordinance is enacted pursuant to KRS 91a.030(10) for the Fiscal Year beginning July 1, 2018 and ending June 30, 2019, by estimating revenues and resources and appropriating funds for the operation of city government and providing the no monies shall be expended by or on behalf of the City of Villa Hills except in accordance herewith. Mr. Ringo asked why pass this now. Mr. Waugaman replied that the finance committee did not object doing it now. He noted that the change in publishing requirements, the cost to publish an ordinance has been reduced from \$1,000 to \$100. He noted the big problem was \$10,000 per month increase in garbage collection fees. Additional discussion followed. Mr.

Waugaman made a motion to approve, seconded by Ms. Vaden. A roll call vote was taken as follows:

Mr. Bruns	Yes	Mr. Ringo	Yes
Mr. Kilburn	Yes	Ms. Vaden	Yes
Ms. Koenig	Yes	Mr. Waugaman	Yes

Motion carried 6-0, all in favor. This will become Ordinance 2018-12.

Discussion and approval of Municipal Order 2018-Q. This is a Municipal Order of the
City of Villa Hills approving a six month extension of the lease agreement with the
Villa Hills Civic Club. Mr. Bruns made a motion to approve, seconded by Mr. Ringo.
Mr. Waugaman clarified that this extended the current lease by 6 months and move
the contract to the city's fiscal year versus a calendar year. A roll call vote was
taken as follows:

Mr. Bruns	Yes	Mr. Ringo	Yes
Mr. Kilburn	Yes	Ms. Vaden	Yes
Ms. Koenig	Yes	Mr. Waugaman	Yes

Motion carried 6-0, all in favor. This will become Municipal Order 2018-15.

The next item on the agenda was Committee Reports.

Committee Reports:

Police Report:

- Chief Allen gave the Police Report.
- Chief Allen stated that officers conducted a follow-up on the Terra Cotta drug bust with additional arrests. He stated that it has been an otherwise normal month and they will clear most of the open cases by the end of the year. Chief Allen reported 172.5 hours of Overtime and 129 hours of Training.
- Chief Allen announced the department received the platinum traffic safety award from AAA for the second year in a row. He congratulated the department's officers.
- Chief Allen thanked everyone for participating in the Shop with a Cop program and thanked River Ridge Elementary for helping to put the event together. He also thanked Chief Wendt and the Fire Department for their help and use of their facility. Mr. Ringo asked everyone who helped to assist again next year.
- Chief Allen announced that the Ben Roethlisberger grant came in and that \$20,000 has been collected for the K-9 in total. He said he will bring the proposal to the new Council next month. Chief noted that additional funding is also in the works.

Safety Report:

- Mr. Bruns gave the safety report.
- Mr. Bruns noted that committee discussed the budget and an amendment was needed, the K-9 was discussed, the upcoming RAD class was discussed, and updates on Shop with a Cop, the digital radios, and the drug bust was provided.
- Mr. Bruns stated that Chief presented a plan to expand the evidence room to meet accreditation standards.
- Mr. Bruns thanked Ms. Koenig, Ms. Vaden, and the Safety Committee for their work.

Engineer Report:

- Mr. Bogen gave the Engineers Report.
- Mr. Bogen reported that Buttermilk Pike is still in the process for easement and on track to have offers to residents by February. He stated that he is working on a Traffic Management Plan and will submit the bid documents for state review soon.
- Mr. Bogen reported that Bluegrass completed Brookview Drive. Mr. Bruns asked if Cardinal is involved with resingalization of Buttermilk and Collins. Mr. Bogen replied that his firm was not involved and that was being worked on by Bayer Becker.
- Mr. Bogen thanked Council for working with him during his short time as City Engineer.

Public Works Report:

- Mr. Kilburn gave the Public Works report.
- Mr. Kilburn he noted that the committee report is at the desk for Council review. He
 pointed out that \$438,400 for road work and \$283,000 is designated for existing
 projects and \$155,000 is left over for Buttermilk which needs \$235,200. Mr. Kilburn
 noted that it's been four years since the grant was approved and the amount has
 been increased. He stated that the \$80,000 remaining can be meet by reviewing
 existing designations and funds.
- Mr. Kilburn noted that The City Engineer is working on Buttermilk and Brookview, noted that Palmer Engineers' work on the easement continues, that Public Works is addressing waters issues on Palomino and Rogers Road, and that decorative street signs will be installed over the winter.
- Mr. Kilburn reported that there are 225 tons salt on hand. He also noted that Mr. Yelton is conducting follow-up on restoration issues involving various contractors.
- Next meeting is January 9th at 1 p.m. in the Administration Conference Room.
- Mr. Kilburn thanked Mayor Callery and all members of Council for their support. Mr. Kilburn also thanked Mr. Bogen, Mr. Yelton, and thanked Mr. Bohman and Mayor Callery for their work and support on the grant. Mr. Kilburn thanked his wife, and he thanked the residents for their support of road funding. Mr. Kilburn stated that the Council can be proud that the roads are in better shape than they were four years ago.

Public Works Director Report:

- Mr. Yelton gave the Public Works Director Report.
- Mr. Yelton stated that Public Works has been working on drains, filling pot holes and equipment maintenance.
- Mr. Yelton reported that old street signs have been surplused and will be sold in silent auction with details to be posted on the City website.
- Mr. Yelton thanked Mr. Ringo, Michaels Construction, Jake Bruns, the Fire Department and Villa Hills Civic Club for their assistance with the disposal of storm debris.
- Mr. Yelton thanked the Prospect Point HOA, Wayne Slusher, and the Garden Club for all their help during the year.
- Mr. Yelton thanked Mayor Callery and Council for their support. HE stated that he looked forward to working with Mayor Jansen and the new Council.
- Mr. Bruns commented that the Fire Department sent kudos to the Public Works Department for their management of the debris pile burn. Mr. Yelton praised his crew for their work on the project.

Events and Beautification Report:

- Ms. Koenig gave the Events and Beautification report.
- Ms. Koenig reported that Christmas in the Park was cancelled due to the weather.
- Mr. Koenig thanked Karen Borros and Ms. Vaden. She also thanked The Garden Club, all of the volunteers who helped with Easter Egg Hunts, Yard Sales, Music Fest, Christmas in the Park, Haunted Trails, and movie nights over the past four years. She also thanked Martha Lange for her help with the new Niewahner greenspace design.
- Ms. Koenig thanked all City staff for their help with events.
- On a non-related note, Ms. Koenig announced that the Radio Station property sold to I-HEART Radio and that it will remain a radio station.

Finance Committee Report:

- Mr. Waugaman gave the finance report.
- Mr. Waugaman reported that Questions budget amendment was discussed and that the Finance Committee recommended approval of the budget amendment.
- Mr. Waugaman noted that attorney fees this month spiking appeal \$377, Nuisance Enforcement \$363, Ordinances/Contracts \$2320 mainly Civic Club lease and Digital Radio procurement, Defend Villa Hills appeals \$10,097, and all others \$1,725 for a total of \$14,882.
- Mr. Waugaman reported that our total assets equal \$3,142,557, minus total liabilities in the amount of \$83,874 for a difference of \$3,058,682. He also reported the various designated fund balances.
- Mr. Waugaman stated that Finance Committee recommended the November financials be submitted to Council for approval and be posted on the city website.
- Mr. Kilburn made the motion, seconded by Mr. Ringo to approve the November Financials and post them to the city's website. A voice vote was taken, all in favor.
- Mr. Waugaman noted that the next meeting is January 14, 2019 at 7:00 p.m.
- Mr. Waugaman thanked the members of the Finance Committee.

Administration Committee Report:

- Ms. Vaden gave the Administration Committee report for December 5, 2018 and noted that the meeting had been posted to YouTube. Ms. Vaden reported that discussion took place regarding a possible employment agreement for the City with Craig Bohman. Ms. Vaden noted that the committee agreed that the employment agreement would be presented to council for consideration to reduce potential monetary loss to the city in potential lawsuits. Ms. Vaden stated that the committee examined the draft agreement and discussed the terms. She noted that discussion also involved changes, deletions, and/or additions to the agreement to be presented to full council. Ms. Vaden noted that committee members and Ms. Stewart went section by section through the draft proposal submitted to council at the November meeting. She stated Ms. Stewart was to make requested changes and the committee would review the changes.
- Ms. Vaden also gave the report from the December 14, 2018 Special Meeting and noted that the meeting had been posted to YouTube. Ms. Vaden reported that the committee reviewed, discussed and made changes and corrections to the proposed employment agreement prepared by Ms. Stewart based on the December 5th meeting. Ms. Vaden stated that all committee members recommended the

- employment agreement be presented to full council on 12/19/2018 for review and consideration.
- Next meeting will be January 2nd in the Administrative Conference Room.

Recreation Committee Report:

- Mr. Ringo stated there was no meeting in December.
- Mr. Ringo thanked Council for approving the Civic Club lease.
- Mr. Ringo reported that will be no January meeting and that the next meeting will be held in February 2019.

Fire Authority Report:

- Mr. Ringo gave the Fire Authority report.
- Mr. Ringo reported the monthly run numbers. He reported that the digital radios have been ordered. Mr. Ringo noted that Villa Hills and Crescent Springs police, Fire and EMS will all be one the same channel for the first time.
- Mr. Ringo discussed protocols for admitting patients to the SUN Behavior Facility. He
 noted that the facility does not accept addicts in the first 24 hours and those
 patients need to go to St. Elizabeth and that the department is working to address
 when to transfer patients.
- Mr. Ringo noted that he along with Paul Morgan, Rod Baehner, and George Bruns will serve on the Fire Authority for the upcoming term. He noted that Jim Cahill is the Authority Treasurer.
- The next meeting is 6:00 p.m. Monday January 21st at the Firehouse.

City Attorney Report:

- Ms. Stewart thanked Mayor Callery and Council and noted that it has been an honor
 to serve the city for the past four years. She stated that she looks forward to serving
 with the next administration if they so desire. Ms. Stewart stated it was nice to
 reconnecting with old friends and meeting new people. She noted that next few
 years are exciting times for the city.
- Mayor Callery thanked Ms. Stewart and stated she had done a good job.

City Administrator Report:

- Mr. Bohman thanked the current Council for their support over the past four years. He noted that he has served 15 years in government, including as an elected official and for a regional agency where he saw city governments in action across the 8 county region. Mr. Bohman stated that the outgoing Mayor and Council are the best overall government he has ever seen in terms of addressing problems, looking to the future, and putting the city on strong footing for the future. He thanked the Mayor and Council for letting him be a part of that.
- Mr. Bohman thanked the city staff, especially the department heads for their work.
- Mr. Bohman personally thanked Mayor Callery for his leadership style which allowed staff to do their job and allowed much activity over the past four years to be accomplished. He also thanked Mayor Callery for his personal support and friendship over the past 20 years.

Mayor's Report

 Mayor Callery thanked the Council for the great things that have been accomplished over the past four years. He also thanked staff for their work.

Old Business:

- The meeting moved the the next item on the agenda, Consideration of draft Municipal Order 2018-N: Authorizing an employment agreement between the City of Villa Hills and Craig T. Bohman.
- Ms. Vaden stated committee recommended the agreement and noted that there are no additional benefits except for the inclusion of a severance package. She noted that nothing in the contract binds the hands of the new Mayor as all employees remain at-will-employees. Ms. Vaden noted the purpose of the agreement is to reduce the legal costs and speed the transition following the decision to terminate. She noted that the legal costs, settlements, to the city for the 4 terminations conducted by the city over the past 5 years total \$326,000, not including 2 lawsuits still outstanding. Ms. Vaden noted that ongoing projects need to be completed to avoid \$350,000 in default on grants. She stated the contract caps potential loses and prevents unexpected settlement payouts.
- Mr. Bruns stated most of the reported \$326,000 in legal expenses is due to contracts that were improperly terminated. He requested to go through page by page. Mr. Ringo noted that he did not receive a red-line version and that he thought it was fair to go through the contract.
- Mr. Ringo clarified that the public would be allowed to speak before the final vote.
 Mayor Callery confirmed that to be the case.
- Mr. Kilburn noted he was asked not to attend the meeting to avoid having the contract voted on. He stated that he had a duty to serve and do his job as a legislator. Mr. Kilburn stated that Mayor Callery kept Mr. Bohman on and that it paid great dividends to the city. However, he asked the Administration committee what has the incoming Mayor and Council done to require the contract. Ms. Vaden stated that she don't want tax dollars to go to lawsuits. Mr. Ringo noted that if the employee is fired for cause that the employee can still sue.
- Mr. Stewart explained that the agreement preserves the at-will status of the
 employee and provides a mechanism by which the new administration can terminate
 the employment agreement for no cause, pays a severance and contains a release of
 all claims. Additional back and forth discussions followed about the at will status of
 the employee, the need for the contact and previous employer/employee based
 decisions in the previous decade. Mayor Callery called for order and asked Council to
 focus on the contract before them.

A motion was made by Mr. Ringo, seconded by Mr. Bruns, to table the issue at this time. A roll call vote was taken as follows:

Mr. Bruns	Yes	Mr. Ringo	Yes
Mr. Kilburn	Yes	Ms. Vaden	No
Ms. Koenig	No	Mr. Waugaman	No

Vote tied 3-3. Mayor Callery voted No to break the tie. Discussion continued.

At the request of Mr. Bruns, Kilburn and Ringo, Council went line by line through the contract. Approximately 2 hours of back and forth discussion between the members of Council, the Mayor, the City Attorney, and the City Administrator/Clerk ensued. During the debate, at 9:27 p.m. Mr. Ringo stepped out of the meeting. Council quorum was reduced to 5 members. He returned at 9:30 p.m. bringing quorum back to 6 members.

The draft contract was amended and the following changes were made:

- Ms. Koenig asked to remove the section that contained negotiation language with the employee in regards to health insurance changes.
- Mr. Kilburn asked to remove the increase in PTO accrual to 15 years of credit.
- Ms. Koenig asked to reduce the severance to 6 months plus accrued PTO.
- Mr. Kilburn requested that a provision be added to clarify that severance would not be paid in the event of a voluntary resignation by the employee.

Other discussions on the draft included:

- The vehicle use policy in the draft had been changed following the last Administration Committee meeting to remove the personal use of the vehicle and limited it to only business use with de minimis personal use while being used for business purposes. The revised language was retained.
- Discussions followed regarding the business related expenses, the list of
 organizations to which the City Administrator/Clerk can be a member, the technology
 equipment provided, termination definitions, the hearings available to the City
 Administrator/Clerk without a waiver, the waiver of rights and global settlement of
 claims language, the 30 day notice of voluntary separation, and the designated
 vacation days in December being in the contract. Consensus emerged to keep these
 provisions intact as drafted.
- Mr. Ringo stated "Shame on the council for doing this". He objected to the contract based on the outgoing Council's effort to tie the new Mayor's hands.

After the Council concluded debate, Mayor Callery opened up the floor to public comments.

- Mayor-elect Heather Jansen suggested not letting the employee who benefits from the contract draft the contract. She addressed rumors that she was going to "clean house" as false and have stated that to the department heads. Ms. Jansen pointed out the no one on the Administration Committee contacted her to ask her what her intentions are for staffing. She commented directly to Mr. Bohman stating that she was going to give everyone a fresh start and move forward. Ms. Jansen noted that it is ultimately up to Mr. Bohman whether he trusts her enough not to sign the contract.
- Resident Jerry Wallace expressed concern about have the city employee write the contract. He stated that Council was tying the hands of the new Mayor. Mr. Wallace pointed out several state statutes that make all employee at-will unless enacted by ordinance and about the prohibition on binding future councils. He stated in his experience as an attorney in Texas and Mississippi that it does not cost \$326,000 to terminate an employee. He stated that what the council is doing is unfair to the new Mayor and Council and is unfair to Mr. Bohman by marking him with their decision to limit the new officials. Mr. Wallace chides Mayor Callery for allowing this to happen to an incoming Mayor. He stated that he has been pretty impressed with Mr. Bohman, but changes after elections are normal. He stated this contract is an insult to the incoming officials.
- Resident Steve Nurre inquired about who asked Mr. Bohman to write the contract.
 Ms. Vaden replied that the City had. Mr. Bohman answered that Mr. Waugaman
 asked to provide a draft contract and that he had provided the ICMA standard
 contract with changes requested by Mr. Waugaman. Mr. Nurre demanded to know if
 other employees were offered contracts. Mr. Bohman replied there are several other

employees with existing contracts. Ms. Stewart pointed out that the contracts are for retired employees on 1 year contracts to avoid the payment of retirement costs. Mr. Nurre asked why the city should give preferential treatment to one employee, stating that it was arbitrary and is discriminatory toward the other employees. Ms. Vaden replied that other employees do have contracts and the city can always consider contracts with other employees. Mr. Nurre disagreement and stated it was preferential to one employee.

- Resident Lou Kees Rust asked for clarification on when contract discussion began and asked why this was not done three years ago. Mr. Waugaman stated that the discussion began before election night and that he is looking at the history of Villa Hills. The crowd heckled Mr. Waugaman. Ms. Kees-Rust demanded to know why this was not done a few years ago. Mr. Waugaman stated it was not needed because everything was going so well in the city, but when change occurs it has resulted in large lawsuits against the city which he is trying to stop by paying a severance. Ms. Koenig stated that this had been discussed by Administration in the previous six months. Ms. Koenig stated that in 17 years on Council she has seen a lot and she is trying to protect the city. Ms. Koenig further stated that residents tell her confidential things which she only reveals their name in court, and she was told about the effort to remove all the "Covington" employees and therefore she feels the need to protect the city. Ms. Kees-Rust stated the current council is forcing the new Mayor into an arraigned marriage and did not give the new Mayor a chance. Further discussion followed and degraded into heckling. Mayor Callery called for order and asked to move to the next speaker.
- Resident Tom Wenning stated that the Mayor and Council have mostly done a great job over the past four years. He stated that Mr. Bohman has done a great job but that the contract is a bad idea not fair and that it places unfair spotlight on Mr. Bohman. Mr. Wenning suggested changing the contract so that all equipment is turned in immediately not in 5 days. He also noted that the changes to policy manual would have to changes twice (once in the policy and once in the contract). Mr. Wenning noted that the Clerk can have a contract according to the ordinance creating the clerk position. He stated the severance is too big.

Mr. Ringo made a motion, seconded by Mr. Bruns to table the amended version of the contract for the new Council. A vote was taken as follows:

Mr. Bruns	Yes	Mr. Ringo Ms. Vaden	Yes
Mr. Kilburn	Yes	Ms. Vaden	No
Ms. Koenig	No	Mr. Waugaman	No

With a 3-3 vote, Mayor Callery voted No to break the tie and the motion was defeated.

- Mr. Kilburn reiterated his first question which was to ask what had the incoming Mayor and Council said or done to require the contract. Mr. Kilburn vouched for Mr. Bohman's good performance. No one replied.
- Mr. Bruns noted that Ms. Koenig spoke of an undercurrent in the city and the Council has ignored it up to tonight. He stated that he does not know where the "Covington" comments have come from. Ms. Koenig reiterated that residents have come to her and told her of comments made during the campaign to remove Mayor Callery, Mr. Bohman and Chief Allen. She told Mr. Bruns that he knows that person and he would respect that person. Back and forth discussion followed.

- Mr. Ringo noted that the new council won several times over the current Mayor and Council and they don't deserve to have to the outgoing Council do this to them and Mr. Bohman doesn't deserve to have this done because it places him in an untenable position with the new Mayor.
- Councilmember-elect Rod Baehner asked to speak. He thanked council for their service and appreciated the work they did. He noted for the record that he spoke directly to Mr. Bohman and told Mr. Bohman he wanted him to stay. Mr. Baehner stated he was elected by the people of Villa Hills and has no agenda against any employee with the city.
- Councilmember-elect Sue Wadsworth stated that no one has gotten to know her or spoken to her. She addressed Mr. Bohman directly and stated she was looking forward to working with everyone. Ms. Wadsworth questioned why the new Council would want to make changes before getting to know the employees. She thanked the Mayor and Council for their service.
- Councilmember-elect Seth Thompson stated that an undercurrent is not taking office but that individuals who had been elected are taking office. He noted that he has sat I the audience for nearly every meeting for three years and that Mr. Baehner and Mr. Cahill have served before. Mr. Thompson stated he is upset because the idea that the new council is going to "blow up" the city is hurtful.

With no further public comments, Mr. Waugaman made a motion to approve the amended contract, seconded by Ms. Koenig. A roll call vote was taken as follows:

Mr. Bruns	No	Mr. Ringo	No
Mr. Kilburn	No	Ms. Vaden	Yes
Ms. Koenig	Yes	Mr. Waugaman	Yes

Mayor Callery voted Yes. Motion carried 4-3. This will become Municipal Order 2018-16

The audience began to disburse in a noisy manner despite the fact that the meeting continued.

Comments:

- Mr. Kilburn thanked his wife for letting him serve and thanked the people of Villa Hills for their trust and confidence. He thanked Mayor Callery and all the members of Council for their support. Mr. Kilburn stated that he hoped that history would look back and see that the city was left in a better condition than it was found
- Ms. Koenig wished everyone a Merry Christmas.
- Mr. Ringo stated that he loved the first 3 years of this council and stated that it
 was powerful however, he felt ostracized after the vote was taken. He stated
 that he believed that the action taken on the contract was an election night
 hangover. He said he still respects the members of Council and the Mayor and
 the work they accomplished.
- Ms. Vaden thanked the Mayor and Council for their time energy and effort
 dedicated to serve the city and to the new council she applauded them for their
 willingness to serve and hope that they enjoy working together. She further
 hoped that they would be treated better than the current members of Council
 have been treated by the public and that they do not need to have police escorts
 for themselves and their children as a result of the votes they take. Ms. Vaden

stated that as a nurse she has sat with many people who are dying and with their loved ones after they pass away. She noted that she has comes home heartbroken on a regular basis and she cannot explain how hurt she has been by her neighbors and the people of the city over the past year. Ms. Vaden emotionally recalled that tonight would have been her father's 80 birthday and that he had passed away earlier in the year. She stated she had missed a meeting sitting at his bedside and that she did not get a single condolence from the community but instead received emails attacking her for missing the meeting. Ms. Vaden stated she does not understand why our community is so mean to each other. She wished the new Council well in their endeavors. Mayor Callery thanked her for her heartfelt comments.

- Mr. Waugaman thanked Mayor Callery. He thanked all of Council, as well as Mr. Bohman and administrative staff. Mr. Waugaman thanked Mr. Yelton and the Public Works staff and stated that they are the best in Northern Kentucky. He praised Chief Allen and said that the officers he has recruited are top notch. Mr. Waugaman then turned to his experience on Council. He noted that he told people that he would vote for what he thought was best and he stated that the Council had accomplished more in four years than any other administration in the history of the City. Mr. Waugaman described the lack of public respect for Council during the past year to include yelling obscenities during meetings, the use of obscene hand gestures, throwing objects at Councilmembers, and stating false accusations as a way to intimidate Council prior to votes. He stated that he learned that people are vindictive, privileged, and elite. Mr. Waugaman thanked the 800 people who voted for him and he noted that what hurt the most was not losing, but that all the people he spoke with and only received a handful shared of negative comments, no one would tell him how they really felt. He provided criticism of the DefendVH group and their campaign tactics. Mr. Waugaman stated that Villa Hills' residents seem to desire controversy. He lamented that the city had slipped back to where is was 8 years ago and how petty people can be and that it is embarrassing.
- Mayor Callery thanked Mary Ann Stewart for her work. He thanked Mr. Bohman and he thanked Council stating that it was a good run and a good time. He also thanked the TBNK staff for all the hours they have spent with the city. Mayor Callery wished the new Mayor and Council well.

With no further business, Mr. Kilburn made a motion to adjourn, seconded by Mr. Waugaman. Voice vote was taken. All in favor.

Time of adjournment was 10:29 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Craig T Bohman, City Administrator/Clerk

Heather H. Jansen, Mayor